9 *Domine, Non Sum Dignus*

Theological Bullying and the Roman Catholic Church

PATRICK S. CHENG

Episcopal Divinity School

Much has been written recently about the classroom bullying of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) youth. Since the fall of 2010, the press has reported a number of horrific suicides, most often those of young teenagers who killed themselves after being bullied repeatedly by their classmates for their actual or perceived sexual orientation or gender identity.[1] The syndicated columnist Dan Savage and his husband Terry Miller founded the "It Gets Better" project in late 2010 as a response to these suicides.[2]

Sadly, as of the summer of 2012, the series of bullying-related suicides by gay youth has continued unabated. On April 15, 2012, fourteen-year-old Kenneth Weishuhn killed himself in Iowa after coming out; allegedly, he had received death threats on his cell phone and was targeted by a Facebook hate group.[3] Just a week later, on April 22, seventeen-year-old Jack Denton Reese killed himself in Utah after experiencing antigay bullying in school.[4] On May 6, seventeen-year-old Jay "Corey" Jones jumped to his death from a bridge in Minnesota after suffering years of bullying for being gay.[5] And on June 2, sixteen-year-old Brandon Elizares killed himself in Texas after allegedly receiving a threatening text message about his sexuality from a classmate.[6]

This essay will focus on a related—and arguably even more harmful—form of bullying: *theological bullying.*[7] In particular, it examines the ways in which the Roman Catholic hierarchy engages in theological bullying against those priests, members of religious orders, and lay people who dissent from the Roman Catholic Church's official teaching about homosexuality (that is, that people who engage in such acts are "intrinsically disordered" and the acts themselves are of "grave depravity").[8]

The first part of this essay will focus on the parallels between classroom bullying and theological bullying. The second part will focus on why we must all resist—and stop—the harmful cycle of theological bullying by the

bishops of the Roman Catholic Church. The final part will focus on some hopeful ways in which LGBT theologies are developing inside and outside the Roman Catholic Church, even in the face of theological bullying.

Theological Bullying

Bullying is defined as a situation in which a stronger person (the "bully") singles out a less powerful person (the "victim") and targets the victim with behaviors intended to harm her or him, often repeatedly over time.[9] Barbara Coloroso, an expert on classroom bullying, has identified five characteristics of bullying in her book *The Bully, the Bullied, and the Bystander.*[10] According to Coloroso, (1) bullying is intentional, (2) bullying is ongoing, (3) bullying uses terror, (4) bullying is marked by an imbalance of power, and (5) bullying arises out of contempt for the "other."[11] Each of these five marks of bullying can be seen in how the Roman Catholic hierarchy treats those who dissent from its teachings about same-sex acts.

First, theological bullying is *intentional.* The targeting of individuals who disagree with the Roman Catholic Church's teachings on same-sex acts is not an accidental matter. Rather, it is very much an intentional act that is intended to shut down any debate. In 1986, the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (CDF)—headed by then-Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger—issued its infamous "Halloween Letter," the "Letter to the Bishops of the Catholic Church on the Pastoral Care of Homosexual Persons," in which the CDF emphasized that same-sex acts were "in no case to be approved of" and are never "a morally acceptable option."[12]

Since 1986, the bishops of the Roman Catholic Church have relied upon the language and reasoning of the CDF's Halloween Letter as part of an intentional and coordinated campaign to silence dissenting voices on this topic. In April 2012, for example, the CDF appointed an archbishop-delegate to oversee the affairs of the Leadership Conference of Women Religious (LCWR). The CDF's doctrinal assessment expressly cited the LCWR's alleged opposition to the Vatican's "correct pastoral approach to ministry to homosexual persons."[13] Further evidence of this intentionality can be seen in the active role that the Roman Catholic Church has played in supporting anti-marriage-equality state constitutional amendments such as California Proposition 8 in 2008 and North Carolina Amendment 1 in 2012.[14]

Second, theological bullying is *ongoing*. The Roman Catholic Church's targeting of individuals who disagree with its teaching on same-sex acts is systematic and has occurred for decades (and, arguably, for centuries).[15] This can be traced at least as far back as the silencing of Father John McNeill in 1977, following the publication of his book *The Church and the Homosexual*, as well as his subsequent expulsion from the Jesuit order in 1987.[16] Father McNeill's silencing was followed in 1999 by the CDF's cease-and-desist order to Sister Jeannine Gramick and Father Robert Nugent with respect to their ministries to lesbians and gay men and their silencing in 2000.[17] Over a decade after Gramick and Nugent's silencing, the CDF has continued its ongoing campaign against dissenting individuals by its actions with respect to the LCWR. In sum, these acts of theological bullying by the Roman Catholic hierarchy are not one-time or isolated events; they have been occurring for many decades.

Third, theological bullying uses *terror*. The Roman Catholic hierarchy uses spiritual terror—as well as economic and political terror—to achieve its ends. By designating same-sex acts as mortal sins, the Roman Catholic Church teaches that noncelibate LGBT people are eternally damned unless they repent and seek absolution from the church. Furthermore, the Roman Catholic hierarchy uses economic terror by directing most of its condemnations against priests and members of religious orders. That is, such individuals make promises or vows of poverty and thus are entirely dependent upon the church for their economic livelihood.

In addition to spiritual and economic terror, the hierarchy also uses veiled political threats, as in the case of then-Archbishop Timothy Dolan's letter to President Barack Obama on September 20, 2011, in which Dolan claimed that the administration's refusal to enforce the Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA) could "precipitate a national conflict between Church and State of enormous proportions."[18] On May 9, 2012, Cardinal Dolan issued a statement that followed President Obama's nationally televised comments in support of same-sex marriage. In that statement, Dolan criticized Obama's position as eroding and ignoring "the true meaning of marriage" and urged all Roman Catholics to "promote and protect marriage."[19]

Fourth, theological bullying is marked by an *imbalance of power*. Under Roman Catholic canon law, the hierarchy holds virtually all of the ecclesial power within the Roman Catholic Church. It has no need to consult with those who hold alternative views. Those who are silenced have no

realistic means of appealing the findings against them. The late English theologian Gareth Moore, a Roman Catholic priest and member of the Dominican order, argued in his book *A Matter of Truth: Christianity and Homosexuality* that "the church teaches badly."[20] That is, instead of testing the truth or falsity of its claims about homosexuality (which, ironically, would be more faithful to the scholastic methods of noted theologians such as Thomas Aquinas), the Roman Catholic Church actually "produces no good arguments to assent to."[21] That is, it uses power and not reason to support its views.[22] Another example of this imbalance of power can be seen in the May 2012 decision by the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops to initiate an inquiry into the Girl Scouts of America following the Girl Scouts' decision to allow transgender girls to participate in its programs.[23] As the Roman Catholic lesbian theologian Mary E. Hunt has put it, the bishops are having a "*Saturday Night Live* moment," employing their vast resources in order to intimidate the Girl Scouts but ending up searching "in vain for condoms in the cookie boxes."[24]

Fifth, theological bullying is marked by *contempt for the "other."* The Roman Catholic bishops refuse to respond to anyone who disagrees with their teachings. More often than not, these individuals are summarily dismissed and ignored. This can be seen in a number of situations in which the "other" is treated without any sense of basic dignity. For example, Dominic Sheahan-Stahl, an alumnus of a Roman Catholic high school in Michigan, was summarily disinvited from speaking at his alma mater's graduation ceremonies simply because he had posted pictures of his engagement to another man on Facebook.[25] Similarly, Cardinal Dolan has refused to meet with or even acknowledge the existence of LGBT homeless youth in New York City, which led Joseph Amodeo, an openly gay member of the junior board of Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of New York, to resign his position.[26] These are just some of the many ways in which the Roman Catholic bishops exhibit a fundamental contempt for the "other."

Stopping the Cycle

Why should we care about theological bullying? Why is this not simply an internal matter of discipline between the Roman Catholic Church and its members? One reason is that bullies are formed and *not* "born that way."

That is, bullies are shaped by households—or organizations—with dysfunctional dynamics. Left unchecked, these dynamics perpetuate themselves in future generations.

Classroom bullies learn how to bully from their families and from their churches. According to Coloroso, bullies often come from what she calls "brick-wall" families that have the following nine characteristics: (1) a parent who has "absolute authority, who enforces order, and who always wins"; (2) a parent who rigidly enforces the rules "by means of actual, threatened, or imagined violence"; (3) a parent who attempts to "break the child's will and spirit with fear and punishment"; (4) a parent who uses humiliation; (5) a parent who uses threats and bribes; (6) a parent who relies heavily upon competition; (7) a parent who creates an "atmosphere of fear" with respect to learning; (8) a parent who shows "love" that is "highly conditional"; and (9) a parent who teaches a child "what to think, not *how* to think."[27]

It is no accident that the Roman Catholic hierarchy and its defenders exhibit many—if not all—of these "brick-wall" family characteristics. Personally, I experienced these dynamics first hand in the spring of 2011, when my book *Radical Love: An Introduction to Queer Theology* was published.[28] In March 2011, I wrote an article for the *Huffington Post* on why I believe Christianity is, at heart, a queer religion.[29] That is, I argued that Christianity, like queerness, is about a radical love so strong that it dissolves the boundaries that separate us.

Shortly after my article was published, the Catholic League for Religious and Civil Rights issued a press release that mocked my article.[30] Even though the Roman Catholic Church was not mentioned in my article, Bill Donahue, the president of the Catholic League, said that I needed a "reality check" and asked whether I had read the Book of Leviticus (which specifies the death penalty for certain same-sex acts).[31] Donahue's attempt to humiliate and silence me is indicative of the kind of "brick-wall" family dynamics described by Coloroso above. Donahue reacted in a similarly uncharitable and dismissive manner when he e-mailed Rabbi Arthur Waskow in June 2012 after Waskow had criticized the Roman Catholic Church's response to the nuns and the LCWR. Donahue told Waskow that not only was he "clueless" about the situation (and that he had "stuck [his] nose" where it didn't belong) but that "Jews had better not make enemies of their Catholic friends since they have so few of them."[32]

What, then, can we do to stop the destructive cycle of theological bullying? Coloroso, in her book on bullying, proposes a solution that involves the important role of the *bystander.* According to Coloroso, there are always three players in any bullying situation: (1) the bully, (2) the victim, and (3) the bystander. According to Coloroso, the bully counts on silence and on the failure of the bystander to speak up against such bullying. Given the important role of the bystander, anybody who witnesses theological bullying must speak up against such bullying.[33] We simply cannot afford to turn a blind eye to any act of bullying, theological or otherwise.

Given the five marks of bullying that are described above, we can—and we must—challenge the theological bullying of the Roman Catholic Church. As bystanders, we must confront the Roman Catholic hierarchy about its intentional targeting and humiliation of those who question church teachings about same-sex acts. Regardless of the imbalance of canonical power between the hierarchy and the laity, we must question and challenge the ongoing punishment of such individuals and not turn a blind eye to this bullying behavior. We must help create safe spaces—economic and otherwise—for those who experience terror from this targeting. We must correct the imbalance of power by supporting prophetic organizations such as New Ways Ministry[34] and the Women's Alliance for Theology, Ethics, and Ritual (WATER).[35] And we must demand that *all* people are treated with respect and dignity as beings who are created in the image and likeness of God.[36]

Voices of Hope

Notwithstanding the existence of widespread theological bullying by the hierarchy of the Roman Catholic Church, the good news is that LGBT theologies have continued to develop—and even flourish—inside and outside of the church. In this section, I will discuss a few hopeful trends with respect to queer theology and the Roman Catholic Church.[37]

First, we have seen the flowering of queer theology outside of the church. In fact, many of the foundational voices of queer theology have been—and continue to be—former Roman Catholics. These voices include not only John McNeill[38] but also Robert Shore-Goss (author of *Jesus Acted Up* and *Queering Christ*),[39] Elizabeth Stuart (author of *Just Good Friends* and *Gay and Lesbian Theologies*),[40] Mark Jordan (author of *Silence*

of Sodom and *Telling Truths in Church*),[41] Donald Boisvert (author of *Out on Holy Ground* and *Sanctity and Male Desire*),[42] and myself.[43] Indeed, it is fair to say that the academic discipline of queer theology would not exist without the groundbreaking work of queer theologians who were raised in the Roman Catholic Church.

Second, we have witnessed the amazing grace of queer theologians who have stayed within the Roman Catholic Church as a result of safe spaces and/or economic freedom. These individuals include Mary Hunt, the Catholic lesbian theologian who co-founded WATER, a world-renowned feminist theological think tank that has operated for nearly thirty years. Hunt is the author and editor of many feminist theological works, including *Fierce Tenderness* and *New Feminist Christianity*.[44] She is also a prolific writer and blogger. Hunt has sharply criticized the Roman Catholic hierarchy for its bullying and intimidation of the LCWR. She has also criticized the CDF's censure of Sister Margaret A. Farley's *Just Love: A Framework for Christian Sexual Ethics* as "the intellectually embarrassing and morally tawdry work of a group that obviously needs a permanent vacation."[45]

Another theologian who has stayed within the Roman Catholic Church is James Alison, a gay priest who has described himself as an ecclesiastical "nonperson" who nevertheless survives "deep in enemy territory," at least from the perspective of the current Roman Catholic hierarchy.[46] Alison's many books include *Faith Beyond Resentment* and *Broken Hearts and New Creations*.[47] In a powerful essay entitled "Letter to a Young Gay Catholic," Alison encourages young LGBT Roman Catholics to persevere in their vocations despite the fact that they are developing ministries "without any public backing from Church authority." One day, Alison writes, there may be a "thaw in the ecclesiastical permafrost," and "talk will get much, much easier." Until then, he assures them that "you are not alone."[48]

Third, we have seen the emergence of LGBT Catholic theologians of color and their allies. For example, we have seen the development of a queer Latino/a Catholic theology by Orlando O. Espín in his book *Grace and Humanness* as well as in his work with the Latino/a roundtable of the Center for Gay and Lesbian Studies in Religion and Ministry at the Pacific School of Religion in Berkeley, California.[49] Espín, a gay Latino professor of systematic theology at the University of San Diego, writes that Latino/a

and black Catholic theologians "cannot ignore LGBT blacks and Latina/os in our theologies, because sexual orientation is an unavoidable real contextualization—as real and unavoidable as race, gender, ethnicity, or culture."[50]

We have also seen the development of queer Black Catholic theologies by scholars such as M. Shawn Copeland. Copeland, an African American professor of theology at Boston College, has argued in her book *Enfleshing Freedom: Body, Race, and Being* that we are all "made new in Christ" and thus must "abolish all claims to racial and cultural superiority" and also "contradict repressive codes of gender formation and sexual orientation." According to Copeland, the Body of Christ is the "only body capable of taking us *all* in as we are with all our different body marks—certainly including the mark of homosexuality."[51]

With respect to Asian and Asian American Catholic queer theologies, we have seen the creative cross-cultural work of Michael S. Campos, who holds a doctorate from the Graduate Theological Union, who has written about the effeminate gay Filipino man known as the *baklâ* and gendered religious performance in Filipino cultural spaces.[52] Other queer Asian Catholic theologies include the work of Lai-shan Yip, who has written about the experiences of Roman Catholic *nu-tongzhi*, or lesbians, in Hong Kong,[53] as well as the work of Joseph Goh, who has written about the doctrine of Mariology and *mak nyahs*, or male-to-female transsexuals, in Malaysia.[54] Campos, Yip, and Goh are all members of the international Emerging Queer Asian Religion Scholars (EQARS) theological collective, which meets monthly via teleconference.[55]

Fourth, we have seen an expansion of what constitutes a Roman Catholic "theologian." That is, in addition to the academic theologians described above, we have also seen the emergence of many Roman Catholics who engage in public theology through new and innovative media channels. These individuals include Marianne Duddy-Burke, the executive director of DignityUSA, the national affirming organization for LGBT Roman Catholics;[56] Diann Neu, the co-founder and co-director of WATER, as well as the co-editor of the *New Feminist Christianity* anthology;[57] Victoria Rue, a Roman Catholic Womanpriest who is also an author, professor, and playwright;[58] and Jamie L. Manson, an alumna of Yale Divinity School and blogger for the *National Catholic Reporter.*[59] By contrast with

the more traditional academic theologians listed above, these individuals—all women—are redefining the role of what it means to be a "theologian" both inside and outside the Roman Catholic Church.

Fifth, we have seen an expansion of what constitutes Roman Catholic "theology." For example, there has been an explosion of LGBT lay Catholic theological reflections in recent years, including the contributions to the *Queer and Catholic* anthology edited by Amie M. Evans and Trebor Healey.[60] New genres of queer Catholic writings have also emerged, including autobiographies of gay Catholics,[61] autobiographies of gay bishops and priests,[62] histories of LGBT-welcoming parishes like Most Holy Redeemer Church in the Castro District of San Francisco,[63] collections of LGBT-affirming liturgies,[64] queer Catholic literary theory,[65] and writings by and for families of LGBT Catholics.[66]

So there is hope, even in the face of widespread theological bullying by the hierarchy of the Roman Catholic Church. To restate a popular saying from my childhood years: The more the Roman Catholic Church tightens its grip, the more queer theological voices will slip through its fingers.[67]

The ideas in this essay were originally presented during the fall of 2011 at the More than a Monologue conference held at Union Theological Seminary in New York City. The Union conference focused on the theme of antigay bullying and was entitled "Pro-Queer Life: The Youth Suicide Crisis, Catholic Education, and the Souls of LGBTQ People." The title of the panel on which I served was "Lord, I Am Not Worthy," or, in Latin, "*Domine, non sum dignus.*"[68] As all good Roman Catholics know, these are the words—more precisely, "Lord, I am not worthy that you should enter under my roof, but only say the word and my soul shall be healed"—that are said at Mass after the *Agnus Dei* and immediately before one goes up to receive Holy Communion.

What most Roman Catholics do not realize, however, is that "*Domine, non sum dignus*" was originally spoken by a Roman centurion who was begging Jesus to heal his beloved servant, or *pais* in the Greek, which could have denoted "a younger lover." As the New Testament scholar L. William Countryman has noted, "it is not intrinsically improbable that this was a case where the slave was the master's sexual companion."[69] Jesus, responding to the centurion's pleading, does in fact grant his request and heals the servant. Ironically, both the centurion and the servant would be denied Holy Communion at most Roman Catholic churches today.[70]

It is time for the Roman Catholic hierarchy to start acting more like Jesus and to follow his unconditional embrace of the centurion and the servant. In other words, the hierarchy should act less like theological bullies and more in accordance with *in persona Christi* (that is, "in the person of Christ").[71] They should welcome to the Eucharistic table all those who seek God's sacramental grace, regardless of whether they are in same-sex or opposite-sex relationships. And perhaps, in so doing, the souls of the Roman Catholic hierarchy might be healed.

19. *Gaudium et Spes*, no. 16.

20. Ahmed, *Queer Phenomenology*, 160.

21. Jean-Luc Nancy's antidote to the suffocating limits of the enclosure is *disenclosure*—a notion that not so much breaks through limits as one that reorients spatiality determined not by limits but by a network of relationships: "In a sense, it is the dissolution or a dissipation of the space of clear topographical distinctions, of the space of territories and boundaries, of domains and enclosures. The space of separations is yielding to the thrust of a spatiality that *separates the separations from themselves*, that seizes the general configuration, in order simultaneously to spread it out in a continuum and to contort it into an interlacing of networks." See Jean-Luc Nancy, *Dis-Enclosure: The Deconstruction of Christianity* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2008), 161. In the same spirit, I suggest that Rudloff's ambivalent hospitality reorients the boundaries of the monastic enclosure toward a *network* of relationships that upholds both familiarity and mystery.

9. *Domine, Non Sum Dignus*: Theological Bullying and the Roman Catholic Church

PATRICK S. CHENG

1. Patrick S. Cheng, "Faith, Hope, and Love: Ending LGBT Teen Suicide," *Huffington Post* (October 6, 2010), http://huff.to/90e2ku.

2. Dan Savage and Terry Miller, eds., *It Gets Better: Coming Out, Overcoming Bullying, and Creating a Life Worth Living* (New York: Dutton, 2011), 1–8.

3. "Kenneth Weishuhn Suicide: Details In Gay Iowa Teen's Death After Allegedly Enduring Threats Emerge," *Huffington Post* (April 18, 2012), http://huff.to/J3hUdr.

4. Andy Towle, "Seventeen-Year-Old Jack Reese Committed Suicide Near Ogden, Utah: Rally Planned," *Towleroad* (April 29, 2012), http://bit.ly/IfikLu.

5. "Jay 'Corey' Jones, Gay Minnesota Teen, Commits Suicide After Allegedly Being Bullied," *Huffington Post* (May 11, 2012), http://huff.to/LxtSM7.

6. Laura Hibbard, "Brandon Elizares, Gay Teen, Commits Suicide, Writing 'I Couldn't Make It. I Love You Guys,'" *Huffington Post* (June 14, 2012), http://huff.to/L8ytqo.

7. In this essay, I use the term "theological bullying" to refer to the bullying of theologians who dissent from the official teaching of the Roman Catholic Church with respect to the sinfulness of same-sex acts. By contrast, I use the term "classroom bullying" to refer to the bullying of LGBT students by their classmates and/or teachers at school.

8. *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, no. 2357.

9. Jim Wright, *Preventing Classroom Bullying: What Teachers Can Do* (February 2004), 3. http://bit.ly/RuxKTR.

10. Barbara Coloroso, *The Bully, the Bullied, and the Bystander* (New York: Collins Living, 2003).

11. Ibid., 13–14, 20–22.

12. Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, "Letter to the Bishops of the Catholic Church on the Pastoral Care of Homosexual Persons" (October 31, 1986), no. 3, http://bit.ly/4CFwuO.

13. Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, "Doctrinal Assessment of the Leadership Conference of Women Religious" (April 18, 2012), II, http://bit.ly/QdXFec.

14. For example, the bishops of the Roman Catholic dioceses of Raleigh and Charlotte mailed postcards to Roman Catholics in the state urging them to vote in favor of North Carolina Amendment 1. See Patrick O'Neill, "N. Carolina Dioceses Mail Postcards Supporting 'Traditional Marriage,'" *National Catholic Reporter* (May 4, 2012), http://bit.ly/KAe34V. See also *NOM Exposed*, http://www.hrc.org/nomexposed.

15. Byrne Fone, *Homophobia: A History* (New York: Picador USA, 2000).

16. See John J. McNeill, *The Church and the Homosexual*, 4th ed. (Boston, Mass.: Beacon, 1993), 217–241.

17. An overview of their work may be found on the New Ways Ministry website, http://newwaysministry.org/co-founders.html. Theological works authored and/or edited by Gramick and Nugent include Jeannine Gramick and Pat Furey, eds., *The Vatican and Homosexuality: Reactions to the "Letter to the Bishops of the Catholic Church on the Pastoral Care of Homosexual Persons"* (New York: Crossroad, 1988); Jeannine Gramick and Robert Nugent, eds., *Voices of Hope: A Collection of Positive Catholic Writings on Gay and Lesbian Issues* (New York: Center for Homophobia Education, 1995); Robert Nugent, ed., *A Challenge to Love: Gay and Lesbian Catholics in the Church* (New York: Crossroad, 1983); Robert Nugent and Jeannine Gramick, *Building Bridges: Gay and Lesbian Reality and the Catholic Church* (Mystic, Conn.: Twenty-Third, 1992). For a documentary film about Gramick, see *In Good Conscience: Sister Jeannine Gramick's Journey of Faith*, directed by Barbara Rick (Out of the Blue Films, 2006).

18. Letter from Timothy M. Dolan to Barack Obama (September 20, 2011), http://bit.ly/p8Lk95.

19. Statement of Timothy Dolan (May 9, 2012), http://bit.ly/J1MxvO. The United States Conference of Catholic Bishops has stated that it is a "requirement of our faith" to exercise "political responsibility" that opposes "intrinsic evils which can never be justified." United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, *Forming Consciences for Faithful Citizenship: A Call to Political Responsibility from*

the Catholic Bishops of the United States, rev. ed. (Washington, D.C.: United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2011), vi–viii.

20. Gareth Moore, *A Question of Truth: Christianity and Homosexuality* (London: Continuum, 2003), 282.

21. Ibid.

22. As Mark Jordan has noted, although the Roman Catholic hierarchy purports to use natural law reasoning in its arguments against homosexuality, the rhetorical structure of its arguments effectively forecloses any debate on the subject. That is, any dissent is "now silenced with blunt claims of authority." Mark Jordan, *The Silence of Sodom: Homosexuality in Modern Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 49.

23. David Crary, "Catholic Bishops Challenge Girl Scouts USA for Conflict with Church Teaching," *Huffington Post* (May 10, 2012), http://huff.to/ITwVzo.

24. Mary E. Hunt, "Bishops Search for Condoms in Cookie Boxes," *Religion Dispatches* (May 21, 2012), http://bit.ly/J99Apm.

25. Laura Hibbard, "Dominic Sheahan-Stahl Denied Michigan High School Keynote Speaker for Being Gay," *Huffington Post* (April 26, 2012), http://huff.to/JHba7i.

26. Verena Dobnik, "Joseph Amodeo Quits Catholic Charities Board Over Cardinal Dolan's Stance on LGBT Youth," *Huffington Post* (April 7, 2012), http://huff.to/IoE5Te.

27. Coloroso, *The Bully*, 78–84. Not surprisingly, many of these same characteristics are present in the formation process of Roman Catholic seminarians. See Jordan, *The Silence of Sodom*, 167–171 (noting how seminarians are required to "spy on one another" and "report any infractions of discipline immediately").

28. Patrick S. Cheng, *Radical Love: An Introduction to Queer Theology* (New York: Seabury, 2011).

29. Patrick S. Cheng, "Radical Love: Why Christianity Is a Queer Religion," *Huffington Post* (March 29, 2011), http://huff.to/hdWOVv.

30. Catholic League for Religious and Civil Rights, "Religious Reality Check" (March 30, 2011), http://bit.ly/IQMPGD.

31. See Lev 20:13, NRSV ("If a man lies with a male as with a woman, both of them have committed an abomination; they shall be put to death; their blood is upon them").

32. Josh Nathan-Kazis, "Catholic League's E-Feud with Rabbi Waskow," *Jewish Daily Forward* (June 20, 2012), http://bit.ly/OyRlO8.

33. Coloroso, *The Bully*, 62–72.

34. See New Ways Ministry, http://newwaysministry.org.

35. See Women's Alliance for Theology, Ethics, and Ritual, http://waterwomensalliance.org.

36. See Gen 1:27.

37. The title of this subsection alludes to Gramick and Nugent, *Voices of Hope*.

38. In addition to *The Church and the Homosexual*, McNeill's works include *Both Feet Firmly Planted in Midair: My Spiritual Journey* (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox, 1998); *Freedom, Glorious Freedom: The Spiritual Journey to the Fullness of Life for Gays, Lesbians, and Everybody Else* (Boston: Beacon, 1995); *Taking a Chance on God: Liberating Theology for Gays, Lesbians, and Their Lovers, Families, and Friends* (Boston: Beacon, 1988).

39. Robert Goss, *Jesus Acted Up: A Gay and Lesbian Manifesto* (New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1993); *Queering Christ: Beyond Jesus Acted Up* (Cleveland, Ohio: Pilgrim, 2002).

40. Elizabeth Stuart, *Just Good Friends: Towards a Lesbian and Gay Theology of Relationships* (London: Mowbray, 1995); *Gay and Lesbian Theologies: Repetitions with Critical Difference* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003).

41. Jordan, *The Silence of Sodom*.

42. Donald L. Boisvert, *Out on Holy Ground: Meditations on Gay Men's Spirituality* (Cleveland, Ohio: Pilgrim, 2000); *Sanctity and Male Desire: A Gay Reading of Saints* (Cleveland, Ohio: Pilgrim, 2004).

43. Cheng, *Radical Love*; Patrick S. Cheng, *From Sin to Amazing Grace: Discovering the Queer Christ* (New York: Seabury, 2012). *Rainbow Theology: Bridging Race, Sexuality, and Spirit* (New York: Seabury, 2013).

44. Mary E. Hunt, *Fierce Tenderness: A Feminist Theology of Friendship* (New York: Crossroad, 1991); Mary E. Hunt and Diann L. Neu, eds., *New Feminist Christianity: Many Voices, Many Views* (Woodstock, Vt.: Skylight Paths, 2010).

45. Hunt's online essay about the Vatican's crackdown on women religious, "We Are All Nuns," has been widely circulated and was quoted by the *New York Times*. See Mary E. Hunt, "We Are All Nuns," *Religion Dispatches* (April 25, 2012), http://bit.ly/I6bruB. For Hunt's online essay about the CDF's censure of *Just Love*, see Mary E. Hunt, "Notify *This*! Vatican Bungles Response to Sexual Ethics Book," *Religion Dispatches* (June 9, 2012), http://bit.ly/LJO6iS.

46. James Alison, *Broken Hearts and New Creations: Intimations of a Great Reversal* (London: Continuum, 2010), 183.

47. James Alison, *Faith Beyond Resentment: Fragments Catholic and Gay* (New York: Crossroad, 2001); Alison, *Broken Hearts and New Creations*.

48. Alison, *Broken Hearts and New Creations*, 182, 185.

49. Orlando O. Espín, *Grace and Humanness: Theological Reflections Because of Culture* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 2007), 51–79; CLGS Latino/a Roundtable, http://bit.ly/gKAxfp.

50. Espín, *Grace and Humanness*, 63.

51. M. Shawn Copeland, *Enfleshing Freedom: Body, Race, and Being* (Minneapolis, Minn.: Fortress, 2010), 82–83.

52. Michael Sepidoza Campos, "The *Baklâ*: Gendered Religious Performance in Filipino Cultural Spaces," in *Queer Religion: LGBT Movements and Queering Religion*, ed. Donald L. Boisvert and Jay Emerson Johnson (Santa Barbara, Calif.: Praeger, 2012), 2:167–191.

53. Lai-shan Yip, "Listening to the Passion of Catholic nu-tongzhi: Developing a Catholic Lesbian Feminist Theology in Hong Kong," in Boisvert and Johnson, *Queer Religion*, 2:63–80.

54. Joseph N. Goh, "*Mak Nyah* Mariology," *Communion* 3 no. 3 (March 2012): 4–7, http://bit.ly/NUSAvt.

55. For the EQARS website, see http://www.eqars.org.

56. For an audio interview of Duddy-Burke challenging Pope Benedict XVI's assertion that same-sex marriage would threaten human dignity and the future of humanity itself, see http://bit.ly/Ai3BQG.

57. http://waterwomensalliance.org. See also Hunt and Neu, *New Feminist Christianity*.

58. For Rue's story, see http://bit.ly/IsotRn.

59. For Manson's blog posts, see http://bit.ly/KmxweS.

60. Amie M. Evans and Trebor Healey, eds., *Queer and Catholic* (New York: Routledge, 2008).

61. Dugan McGinley, *Acts of Faith, Acts of Love: Gay Catholic Autobiographies as Sacred Texts* (New York: Continuum, 2004); Richard Giannone, *Hidden: Reflections on Gay Life, AIDS, and Spiritual Desire* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2012).

62. Rembert G. Weakland, *A Pilgrim in a Pilgrim Church: Memoirs of a Catholic Archbishop* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2009); Paul Murray, *Life in Paradox: The Story of a Gay Catholic Priest* (Winchester: O Books, 2008).

63. Donal Godfrey, *Gays and Grays: The Story of the Gay Community at Most Holy Redeemer Catholic Church* (Lanham, Md.: Lexington, 2007).

64. Edward F. Gabriele, *Cloud Days and Fire Nights: Canticles for a Pilgrimage out of Exile* (Winona, Minn.: Saint Mary's Press, 1997).

65. Lowell Gallagher, Frederick S. Roden, and Patricia Juliana Smith, eds., *Catholic Figures, Queer Narratives* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007).

66. Mary Ellen Lopata and Casey Lopata, *Fortunate Families: Catholic Families with Lesbian Daughters and Gay Sons* (Victoria, Canada: Trafford, 2003).

67. See *Star Wars: A New Hope*, directed by George Lucas (1977; Los Angeles: Lucasfilm, Twentieth Century Fox Corporation), Princess Leia Organa speaking to Grand Moff Tarkin, http://imdb.to/JsweLv.

68. Matt 8:8; Luke 7:6.

69. L. William Countryman, *Dirt, Greed, and Sex: Sexual Ethics in the New Testament and Their Implications for Today*, rev. ed. (Minneapolis, Minn.: Fortress, 2007), 246. See also Tom Horner, *Jonathan Loved David: Homosexuality in*

Biblical Times (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978), 122; Nancy Wilson, *Our Tribe: Queer Folks, God, Jesus, and the Bible* (New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1995), 162.

70. See, for example, Michael Bernard Kelly, *Seduced by Grace: Contemporary Spirituality, Gay Experience, and Christian Faith* (Melbourne, Australia: Clouds of Magellan, 2007), 59–62 (describing the rainbow sash movement in which people wearing rainbow sashes to Mass are denied communion).

71. Second Vatican Council, *Lumen Gentium*, Dogmatic Constitution on the Church, no. 28 (November 21, 1964), http://bit.ly/MEkem.

10. Wild(e) Theology: On Choosing Love

FREDERICK S. RODEN

1. Oscar Wilde, *De Profundis and Other Writings*, ed. Hesketh Pearson (New York: Penguin, 1986), 175.

2. On Raffalovich's Jewishness, see Frederick S. Roden, "Marc-André Raffalovich: A Russian-French-Jewish-Catholic Homosexual in Oscar Wilde's London," in *Jewish/Christian/Queer: Crossroads and Identities*, ed. Frederick S. Roden (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2009), 127–137.

3. See Frederick S. Roden, *Same-Sex Desire in Victorian Religious Culture* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), chap. 6, a discussion of Raffalovich's *Uranisme et Unisexualité* (1896).

4. Marc-André Raffalovich, *Uranisme et Unisexualité* (Lyons: Storck, 1896), 32. My translation.

5. For further on Raffalovich and Gray, see Frederick S. Roden, "Michael Field, John Gray, and Marc-André Raffalovich: Re-Inventing Romantic Friendship in Modernity," in *Catholic Figures, Queer Narratives*, ed. Lowell Gallagher, Frederick S. Roden, and Patricia Juliana Smith (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 57–68.

6. E. E. Bradford, "Is Boy-Love Greek?" in *The New Chivalry and Other Poems* (London: Kegan Paul, 1918), p. 31, line 6.

7. See Frederick S. Roden, "The Catholic Modernist Crisis, Queer Modern Catholicisms," in *Catholic Figures, Queer Narratives*, ed. Lowell Gallagher, Frederick S. Roden, and Patricia Juliana Smith (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 1–18. My gratitude goes to Philip Healy, Raffalovichian *par excellence*, for his many suggestions and pioneering work on this subject.

8. Thomas Michael Loome, "Tyrrell's Letters to André Raffalovich II," *The Month* 229 (1970): 140.

9. Ibid.

10. Ibid.

11. Ibid., 142.

12. Ibid., 144.